

Draft Clause and Informational Note

Draft standard, normative clause with a note and a table | Marked-up specimen

<https://www.editfast.com/editing-services/standards-development-organizations>

A draft clause set against the drafting manual the committee adopted, following the working group's own record where it classifies a statement and referring back where it does not.

ORIGINAL, WITH EDITS MARKED

SPECIMEN, PREPARED BY EDITFAST FOR ILLUSTRATION. NOT A REAL RECORD.

Fenmoor Technical Committee 12 (fictitious), draft standard FTC 12-4, clause 6.3

EXTRACT FROM THE WORKING GROUP'S DECISION RECORD (reproduced unchanged in both panels)

WG-1 The committee has adopted the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, as its drafting manual.

WG-2 Balloted as a requirement: the enclosure is sealed before the pressure test.

WG-3 Balloted as a requirement: the test is not performed below 5 degrees Celsius.

WG-4 Balloted as explanatory only: the remark that sealing compounds cure more slowly in cold weather.

WG-5 Balloted as a requirement: the tolerance in the note beneath Table 3.

WG-6 The term sealed is defined in clause 3.9 of this draft.

6.3 Pressure test

6.3.1 The enclosure must be sealed before the test is carried out.¹

6.3.2 The test may not be performed below 5 degrees Celsius.²

NOTE 1 Sealing compounds cure more slowly in cold weather. The enclosure shall be held at the test temperature for not less than 30 minutes before the test begins.³

Table 3 - Test pressures

NOTE 2 Informational. Pressures are subject to a tolerance of plus or minus 2 percent.⁴

WHAT CHANGED, AND WHY

#	Was	Now	Reason
1	6.3.1 The enclosure must be sealed before the test is carried out.	6.3.1 The enclosure shall be sealed, as defined in 3.9, before the test is carried out.	WG-2 records this as a requirement, and WG-1 records the manual. The Directives instruct drafters not to use "must" as an alternative for "shall," reserving it for constraints outside the document. WG-6 records sealed as a defined term, so the cross-reference points a reader at clause 3.9.

#	Was	Now	Reason
2	6.3.2 The test may not be performed below 5 degrees Celsius.	6.3.2 The test shall not be performed below 5 degrees Celsius.	This is a negative permission, which the Directives describe as ambiguous. WG-3 records the statement as a requirement, so it is written as one rather than left to read either as a prohibition or as an absence of permission.
3	NOTE 1 Sealing compounds cure more slowly in cold weather. The enclosure shall be held at the test temperature for not less than 30 minutes before the test begins.	6.3.3 The enclosure shall be held at the test temperature for not less than 30 minutes before the test begins. [Query to the working group: this sentence is written with shall, and clause 24.5 does not allow a note to contain a requirement. The decision record does not classify it. Please confirm the classification before this clause number is adopted.] / NOTE 1 Sealing compounds cure more slowly in cold weather.	The note held two sentences. The second is written with shall, and clause 24.5 of the Directives, which WG-1 records as the committee's adopted manual, provides that notes shall not contain requirements. The two sentences are separated, and the one written with shall is moved out of the note under a query. Whether it should have been balloted as a requirement is the working group's question, and the drafting fault is visible without answering it.
4	NOTE 2 Informational. Pressures are subject to a tolerance of plus or minus 2 percent.	NOTE 2 Pressures are subject to a tolerance of plus or minus 2 percent.	WG-5 records the tolerance as a requirement, and the word Informational said the opposite. ASTM records that table notes are part of the table and are mandatory provisions, but WG-1 records the Directives as the adopted manual rather than ASTM. What is editable here is the contradiction between the label and the ballot record, and whether the tolerance belongs in the table body is the working group's question.